Welcome to the Building Healthy, Equitable Communities Series

A virtual space for exploring the topic of health equity
2018 SCHEDULE

c changelabsolutions.org/the-series

**Episode 1: Health Equity**  (April)
Building healthy, equitable communities through equitable laws and policies

**Episode 2: Healthy Children & Families**  (May)
Building healthy, equitable communities through supports for working families

**Episode 3: Food Systems**  (June)
Building healthy, equitable communities through a just food system

**Episode 4: Built Environment**  (August)
Building healthy, equitable communities through comprehensive long-range planning

**Episode 5: Schools**  (September)
Building healthy, equitable communities through transforming the school climate

**Bonus Training: Preemption**  (October)
Preemption, public health, and equity - the search for local solutions

**Episode 6: Community Pillar**  (October)
Building healthy, equitable communities through community-driven solutions
The information provided in this discussion is for informational purposes only, and does not constitute legal advice. ChangeLab Solutions does not enter into attorney-client relationships.

ChangeLab Solutions is a non-partisan, nonprofit organization that educates and informs the public through objective, non-partisan analysis, study, and/or research. The primary purpose of this discussion is to address legal and/or policy options to improve public health. There is no intent to reflect a view on specific legislation.

© 2018 ChangeLab Solutions
What is preemption and how is it being used around the country?

How is preemption related to public health and health equity?

How is preemption affecting equity?

What are some resources to address preemption?
What is preemption and how is it being used around the country?
Federalism & Police Power
What is preemption?

When the law of a higher level of government invalidates the law of a lower level of government.
Kim Haddow
State Preemption of Any Local Tobacco Control Ordinances—Advertising, Licensure, Smokefree Indoor Air, or Youth Access

In effect as of June 30, 2018 (n=58)

Source: The CDC’s STATE System interactive application that presents current and historical state-level data on tobacco use prevention and control.
Gun Preemption Laws

Source: Grassroots Change.
Sweeping state laws that clearly, intentionally, extensively, and at times punitively bar local efforts to address a host of local problems.

Often propelled by trade association and business lobbying, many preemptive state laws are aimed not at coordinating state and local regulation but preventing any regulation at all.

– Richard Briffault, Columbia University School of Law
The quantity of preemption laws has skyrocketed.

- 25 states now preempt local minimum wage laws
- 22 states now ban local paid sick days
- 41 states now prohibit local regulation of ride-sharing
- 43 states limit local authority to regulate guns or ammunition
- 20 states have banned local control over 5G tech
- 10 states have prohibited local plastic bag bans
- 3 states now ban soda taxes
The state is **interfering** on more **policy areas**

- Labor Standards
- Public Health & Safety
- Civil Rights
- Taxing & Revenue
- 5G & Broadband
- Environmental Protection
- Local Zoning
Preemption is being used to overturn elections

- **TEMPE, AZ**: Campaign finance disclosure law - 91%
- **NASHVILLE, TN**: Local Hire Law - 57%
- **MILWAUKEE, WI**: Paid Sick Days - 69%
- **AUSTIN, TX**: Defeated UBER’s efforts to escape regulation - 56%
- **DENTON, TX**: Fracking Ban - 59%
- **FAYETTEVILLE, AR**: Nondiscrimination ordinance - 53%
Preemption is being used to *perpetuate inequity*
Preemption bills have become **punitive, wider in scope, more hostile to home rule**
“I am calling for legislation that reduces, restricts and prohibits local regulations.”

-Texas Governor Greg Abbott

“We promote [local control] as a means to achieve liberty...when it’s being oppressive, then absolutely we believe in state control.”

-Christine Sandefur, the Goldwater Institute
The 2018 legislative session continued the trend

- WI Death Star; PA HB 861 moving now
- TN and IA both passed sanctuary city bans w/ punitive provisions
- TX SB4 very punitive actuary city bill went into effect after unsuccessful legal challenge
- AZ preempted Tempe's Campaign Finance Disclosure Law 16 days after passage
- Preemption banning cities from regulating tobacco & e-cigarettes in HI & PA
Traditional powers of cities are under attack.

- **CONTRACTING**
  - AZ, WI

- **ELECTIONS**
  - AZ

- **ZONING**
  - Short-term rentals, multiple states
California’s Soda Tax Ban: A Chilling New Tactic

The American Beverage Association dropped its November ballot initiative that would have seriously weakened the ability of local communities to raise revenues - once the state legislature passed a law banning local soda taxes until 2030.

This form of extortion may be replicated.
New recognition of the impact of preemption on racial equity

“Today, racism is no longer pledged from the portico of the capitol or exclaimed from the floor of the constitutional convention; it hides, abashed, cloaked beneath ostensibly neutral laws and legitimate bases, steering government power toward no less invidious ends.”

The U.S. Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit found that advocates had established a plausible legal claim of race discrimination after the majority white Alabama legislature preempted a local minimum wage increase in Birmingham, a majority African-American city.
How is preemption related to public health and health equity?
Tobacco Control
The Equity Landscape
"People who live in cities and towns want control over their own destinies," said National League of Cities CEO and Executive Director Clarence E. Anthony. "When states take away the ability of local leaders to make decisions, the values and will of the people are ignored."
Preemption isn’t universally negative or even inherently partisan.
Local Control
How preemption affects health equity depends on the type of preemption & how it's used.
Ceiling Preemption

- Uniform Standards
- Efficiency?
- Equal Treatment
Ex: Menu Labeling

Southern Style Chicken
5.9 9 meal 3.6 9 sandwich
780-1020 Cal. 400 Cal.

Chicken Selects
6.4 9 3 pc. meal 4.1 9 3 pc.
780-1020 Cal. 400 Cal.
7.8 9 5 pc. meal Sauces
1040-1280 Cal. 70-200 Cal.
What about vacuum/null preemption?
What are the consequences?

- Creating a regulatory vacuum
- Limiting local control
- Preventing some innovations without adding to uniformity
Floor
Preemption

Flexibility
Innovation
Progress
Ex: School Nutrition Standards
Advance Health Equity
Pushing Back: Political Process
Pushing Back: Litigation
How is preemption affecting equity?
State Interference: Undermining Racial and Gender Justice

Miya Saika Chen
Partnership for Working Families
October 16, 2018
State Interference: Undermining Racial and Gender Justice

Corporate Capture of State Legislatures

Deregulation—removing protections for workers, tenants, LGBTQ and vulnerable communities, the environment

Systems of Oppression—white supremacy, misogyny
Minimum Wage

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local requirements that employers pay wages that exceed the federal or state minimum. These laws often exempt local governments as employers and sometimes exempt employers contracting with local government.

- Construction Jobs Standards
- Employee Benefits
- Fair Scheduling
- Gig Worker + Consumer Rights
- Housing Affordability
- Immigrants' Rights
- Minimum Wage
- Nondiscrimination
- Workplace Equity

www.forworkingfamilies.org/preemptionmap
Housing Affordability

These state laws and court decisions prohibit or limit local laws that regulate residential rents or provide for inclusionary zoning. Often these laws exempt property that the local government owns or in which it otherwise has a proprietary interest. KEY TERM: "Inclusionary zoning" means a requirement that a residential development project provide a certain share of units in the project as affordable at particular levels of affordability.
Gig Worker + Consumer Rights

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local regulation or taxation of transportation network companies and in some cases provide that transit network company drivers are independent contractors, not employees, if certain conditions are met. KEY TERM: "Transportation Network Companies" are companies like Uber and Lyft that provide transportation services using a web-based platform to connect customers and drivers.
Uber & Lyft: Running Over Local Democracy

#uberinterference
Employee Benefits

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local laws that require employers to provide employment benefits to employees, including paid or unpaid sick or family leave, or health, retirement, vacation, disability, profit sharing or death benefits. Often these laws do not apply to local governments as employers.
Housing Affordability

These state laws and court decisions prohibit or limit local laws that regulate residential rents or provide for inclusionary zoning. Often these laws exempt property that the local government owns or in which it otherwise has a proprietary interest. KEY TERM: "Inclusionary zoning" means a requirement that a residential development project provide a certain share of units in the project as affordable at particular levels of affordability.
Construction Jobs Standards

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local laws requiring construction employers to become party to project labor agreements or other agreements with unions, pay prevailing wages, or participate in apprenticeship programs. KEY TERMS: A “project labor agreement” is an agreement between construction project owners and contractors and building trades unions that typically ensures no strikes or work stoppages and establishes uniform labor standards for the project. "Prevailing wages" are wage levels typically determined by a government agency to be the standard for a particular region based on what is being paid in that regional market. An "apprenticeship program" is a training program for new construction workers. "Labor neutrality agreements" are agreements under which an employer agrees to remain neutral toward union organizing activity.
### Mostly White State Legislatures Stop Majority Black Cities from Addressing Racial Wage Gaps

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Atlanta</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>$1,959</td>
<td>$1,577</td>
<td>$0.81</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birmingham</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>$1,715</td>
<td>$1,420</td>
<td>$0.83</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>$1,439</td>
<td>$1,285</td>
<td>$0.89</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durham</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>$1,713</td>
<td>$1,325</td>
<td>$0.77</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memphis</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>$1,952</td>
<td>$1,361</td>
<td>$0.70</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Orleans</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>$2,108</td>
<td>$1,707</td>
<td>$0.81</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>$1,650</td>
<td>$1,343</td>
<td>$0.81</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AVERAGE</strong></td>
<td><strong>55%</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,784</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,431</strong></td>
<td><strong>$0.80</strong></td>
<td><strong>80%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Increased Consequences of Minimum Wage and Employee Benefits Preemption on Women

WOMEN

= Majority of low-wage workers nationally
  = 60% of the workers earning wages at or below the federal minimum in Pennsylvania

= Less likely to have paid sick leave

= Less likely to afford to take leave without pay

= Two-thirds of all family caregivers

→ In 29% of African American families with young children, the primary provider is a Black woman

= Less likely to go to the doctor and access preventative care
Workplace Equity

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local laws protecting job applicants with criminal histories from discrimination in hiring and local laws that favor local residents for hiring by local government contractors.
Immigrants' Rights

These state laws preempt (meaning prohibit or limit) local sanctuary city laws such as those that limit cooperation by local law enforcement with federal immigration enforcement officials.
What are some resources to address preemption?
Voters have a high opinion of their local government, and are divided in their feelings towards state government.

Congress receives incredibly negative reviews.

Now, you will see a list of different organizations and institutions. Please indicate whether you believe each is doing an excellent, good, not so good, or poor job of working on the issues that matter most to you. Here is the first one...

![Bar chart showing the public's opinion of different government entities.](chart.png)
Voters agree that “local knows best.”

Below is a list of reasons that some people have given as to why it is important to protect local governments’ ability to make their own laws. Please select the TWO most important reasons for you personally.

- Local governments are more connected to the needs of the community and therefore can pass policies that reflect their community’s values (58%)
- When local governments are restricted from passing their own economic, health and safety policies, it undermines democracy and tells communities that their needs and votes don’t matter (39%)
- Local governments are less likely to have corporate special interest and lobbyists intruding and trying to influence the laws that pass (36%)
- It is wrong that state governments are misusing their authority by preventing and overturning laws passed democratically at the local level (35%)
- Local governments are centers of innovation and economic growth where new ideas for solving problems and new jobs are created (31%)
Voters believe preemption happens most frequently due to the influence of special interests.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons for Preemption</th>
<th>%Frequently</th>
<th>%Frequently +sometimes</th>
<th>%Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate special interests and lobbyists convince state legislators to block a local law because it would hurt their profits.</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservative state legislators vote to block a local law passed by a progressive city because they disagree with it.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State legislators vote to block a local law as a check and balance to ensure that local laws do not contradict or violate state laws.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progressive state legislators vote to block a local law passed by a conservative town because they disagree with it.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State legislators vote to block a local law to avoid creating a patchwork of laws where cities across the state have different laws.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State legislators block a local law because local regulation can be oppressive and violate personal liberty and individual freedom.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Voters are deeply concerned about consequences of preemption, especially on workers, public health & protections.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consequences of Preemption: Top Tier</th>
<th>Overall</th>
<th>Move to Negative Impact</th>
<th>Move to threaten Democracy</th>
<th>Conflicted Voters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%Concerns a great deal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State legislators are undoing workplace policies that protect workers from wage theft and employer abuse, allow workers to earn paid sick time, and raise the local minimum wage. In one state, state legislators REDUCED a local minimum wage by almost $3 an hour. Without these policies, workers risk being taken advantage of and losing the opportunity to earn their way out of poverty</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Several state legislatures are passing laws that ban all local governments in their state from passing ANY policies that address economic issues, meaning that local communities are powerless to do anything that might help their local economy or protect workers.</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State legislators in several states have voted to prevent local communities from passing protections that keep the community healthy, including clean air and water protections, and passing a ban on natural gas fracking even though a recent study came out that found that babies born in communities near fracking sites experience lower birth weights, and fracking is also known to cause lung damage and seizures</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Anzalone Liszt Grove Research
Local communities know best how to meet the needs of the people living there. It is wrong for the state government to come in and dictate to local people what is best for them.
Local communities pass policies to help their local businesses thrive and create an economy that works for the people who live there. When state lawmakers prevent communities from passing economic policies that work for them, they hinder economic growth and development.
Sadly, political gridlock and corporate special interests have made it hard to get anything done at the state level.

At least at the local level, we can make our voices heard and demand change and accountability, from people we see here at home.
1. Start with normative values
2. Introduce the policy imperative
3. Identify the threat
4. Clarify negative consequences
RECOMMENDATIONS: DO’S

THEM: Preemption advocates argue that preemption is necessary to escape the “oppression of local control” and that local regulations violate “personal liberty” and freedom.

US: Counter their claim with the VALUES of local democracy, control, and local leaders’ ability to best meet the community’s unique views, values and needs.
RECOMMENDATIONS: DO’S

GIVE EXAMPLES OF PREEMPTION’S NEGATIVE IMPACT

• The polling confirms that voters are deeply concerned upon learning that state legislators have undone workplace policies and protections.

• Past research has also found that prohibitions on localities from passing nondiscrimination policies are incredibly unpopular.

• There is also power in highlighting that preemption is being used to overturn election results.
RECOMMENDATIONS: DO’S

ASSIGN MOTIVE & CONSIDER LANGUAGE

- Don’t talk about “preemption.” Use the term “state interference” instead.
- Talk about the “misuse” or “abuse” of preemption.
- Use the terms “local democracy” and “local control.”
- Remind voters who’s behind this: deep-pocketed corporate special interests and their lobbyists.
RECOMMENDATIONS: DON’TS

- Don’t make this a partisan issue
- Don’t make this a process discussion
- Don’t disparage the role of state gov’t
- Don’t use terms like “an attack on cities”
- Don’t accept patchwork argument
A hub that connects, supports, and creates cross-issue, coalitional opportunities and efforts to defend local democracy, repeal existing anti-democratic preemption laws, discourage the use of punitive preemption, and strengthen home rule.

**LEGAL HOTLINE:** 212.430.5989

**FORDHAM’S URBAN LAW CENTER:** [https://www.urbanlawcenter.org/](https://www.urbanlawcenter.org/)

**A BETTER BALANCE:** [https://www.abetterbalance.org/our-campaigns/defending-local-democracy/](https://www.abetterbalance.org/our-campaigns/defending-local-democracy/)
Thank you!

Questions?

changelabsolutions.org/the-series
Want more health equity?

Next up, our last episode: Building Healthy, Equitable Communities Through Community-Driven Solutions

Blog Post: available now!
Webinar & Interactive Panel: Oct. 30 (register now!)

changelabsolutions.org/the-series
Resources for changemaking:

- Fundamentals of Preemption
- The Consequences of Preemption for Public Health Advocacy
- Negotiating Preemption
- Preemption by Any Other Name

For these and other resources, visit us at changelabsolutions.org
Keep the conversation going

Sabrina Adler: sadler@changelabsolutions.org
Kim Haddow: kimshaddow@gmail.com
Miya Saika Chen: miya@forworkingfamilies.org

For questions about the series, Sophia Pennella: spennella@changelabsolutions.org